

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION

CERTIFICATE OF ALTERATION

June 10, 2025

HLC CASE NO: HST25-183

ADDRESS: 574 S Academy

HISTORIC DISTRICT: Sophienburg Hill

HISTORIC LANDMARK: N/A

APPLICANT: Jason Owens

OWNER: BlueGreen Waves, Inc

TYPE OF WORK: Window replacement, Porch repairs, Addition, Siding, Doors

REQUEST: The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Alteration to:

- 1. Replace the existing metal roof with a new metal roof.
- 2. Construct a new rear addition.
- 3. Repair the front porch including in kind column replacement and corbel reconstruction.
- 4. Replace the existing windows with new windows.
- 5. Replace the siding/skirting on the house with hardi siding.
- 6. Replace the front door with a new door.
- 7. Remove the side door at the porch area.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

New Braunfels Code of Ordinances, Chapter 66 – Historic Preservation

Sec. 66-58. Criteria for approval of an alteration certificate.

In considering an application for an alteration certificate, the commission shall be guided by any adopted design guidelines, and where applicable, the following from the secretary of the interior's standards for the



rehabilitation of historic buildings. Any adopted design guidelines and secretary of the interior's standards shall be made available to the property owners of historic landmarks or within historic districts.

- 1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment.
- 2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
- 3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
- 4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
- 5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible.
- 6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- 7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.
- 8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.
- 9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.



10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired.

FINDINGS:

- a. The house at 574 S Academy is a single-story Folk Victoria structure. It is in the Sophienburg Hill Historic District.
- **b. REAR ADDITION**: The applicant is requesting to build a new addition at the rear of the house and property.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. The addition is at the rear of the structure and is subordinate to the roof line on the historic structure.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. N/A
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. **N/A**
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. N/A
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on



accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. N/A

- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. The proposed addition is at the back of the property and will attach to the existing garage which is not of historic age. Materials include hardi-siding, metal roof, and aluminum clad windows.
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. If the addition is removed in the future, the essential form of the historic building will remain unchanged.
- **c. ROOF REPLACEMENT**: The applicant is requesting to replace the existing metal roof on the main house with a new standing seam metal roof with striations.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. The replacement of the roof material with a comparable material is considered a minimal alteration.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. N/A
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. N/A



- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. N/A
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. The house currently has a metal roof. Installing a new metal roof is consistent with the criteria for approval.
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. N/A
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. **N/A**
- **d. SIDING REPLACEMENT**: The applicant is requesting to replace the existing wood siding and skirting on the main house with a low profile, fiber cement lap siding.

(1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. Retaining the original wood siding requires the least alteration to the structure. Repair and maintenance of existing siding preserves the building's authenticity and avoids the need for invasive work.



- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. The existing wood siding can be considered a defining architectural feature and should be maintained where possible.
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. N/A
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. N/A
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. Best preservation practices call for repair over replacement. Deteriorated wood siding can often be selectively replaced using in-kind materials. Full replacement should only occur when no other option is feasible, and the new material should reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities.
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. N/A



- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. N/A
- **e. WINDOW REPLACEMENT**: The applicant is requesting to replace the existing windows throughout the house including the historic and non-historic windows.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. N/A
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. Windows can be considered a character-defining element of a historic structure. Their materials, proportions, muntin patterns, and glazing are integral to the building's architectural identity. Replacing them removes distinctive historic fabric and can alter the character of the building.
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. N/A
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. **N/A**
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. **Historic wood windows were typically designed for repair and built by skilled craftsmen.**
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. Best practices in preservation prioritize repair. Original wood windows can often be restored with simple maintenance, weather stripping, and storm windows. Sashes can also be re-built to match the historic



appearance and elements using new or reclaimed wood, and openings/frames can be restored, sealed and weatherized to be as efficient as contemporary replacement windows.

Replacement of non-historic windows with a replacement that is consistent with historic dimensions and materials is generally considered consistent with the criteria for approval.

- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. Replacement of non-historic windows with a replacement that is consistent with historic dimensions and materials is generally considered consistent with the criteria for approval.
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. **N/A**
- **f. FRONT DOOR REPLACEMENT**: The applicant is requesting to replace the existing front door on the main house. The existing door is not original to the house.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. **The existing door opening is not changing.**
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. The door was installed within the last 10 years based on Google earth images and is not original to the house.
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. N/A



- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. **N/A**
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. The existing door is not original to the house. A replacement door, in this instance, may be appropriate. Staff recommends the replacement door feature a design consistent with the Folk Victorian style of the house such as a single oval or square lite.
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. N/A
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. **N/A**
- **g. SIDE DOOR REMOVAL**: The applicant is requesting to remove the secondary door beneath the front porch and infill with siding.



- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. Folk Victorian homes often feature secondary doors or windows in this location on the front porch.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. **N/A**
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. N/A
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. **N/A**
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. N/A
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. N/A
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. **N/A**



- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. The door can be re-installed in the future, and this would not damage the form or integrity of the building.
- **h. PORCH REPAIRS**: The applicant is requesting to repair the front porch including replacing the existing porch columns and re-introducing missing decorative elements including corbels and gingerbread detailing.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment. Restoring the porch to its original condition is consistent with the guidelines with historic documentation. Additionally, staff finds that should the porch require repairs to the floorboards and other elements, rebuilding it to match is appropriate.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. The existing porch columns and corbels are generally consistent with the Folk Victorian style of the house.
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. **N/A**
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected. N/A
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible. N/A
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures. The existing turned columns should be repaired where possible. Should replacement be necessarily, the new columns should match the existing in appearance, dimensions, and material. Replication of the missing



corbels should be based on the existing corbels on the porch or historic evidence such as old images of the house.

- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken. N/A
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project. **N/A**
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment. N/A
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired. **N/A**

STAFF ANALYSIS:

Staff recommends approval of the addition, in-kind roof replacement, door replacement, porch repairs/reconstruction, and replacement of non-historic windows based on findings b, c, and f through h.

Staff recommends that the existing wood siding and wood windows on the historic structure be retained where possible to be consistent with the criteria for approval. Any damaged siding should be replaced using in kind materials. The historic wood windows should be repaired or rebuilt using in kind materials.

Should the HLC move to approve these two items, staff recommends the following conditions:

- 1. That the replacement siding matches the existing in profile as closely as possible.
- 2. That the replacement windows match the existing historic windows in appearance, dimension, material and feature a true divided lite.



COMMISSION ACTION: The HLC moved to approve the Certificate of Alteration for the construction of a rear addition, replacement of the existing siding on the historic structure with a hardi siding that features a reveal of no more than 5-inches, replacement of the existing front facing door, the removal of the secondary door adjacent to the front door, rebuild or replace in kind the existing front porch columns, repair/replicate missing corbels, replacement of the existing metal roof with a new metal roof, and the restoration or replication of the six historic wood windows on the primary structure.

Katie Totman

Historic Preservation Officer

Sec. 66-571.1 Incentives

(d) Building permit fees waived. Upon approval of a certificate of alteration, the property owner will present said certificate to the building department and all building permit fees will be waived.

ALL BUILDING PERMIT RELATED FEES SHALL BE WAIVED WITH THE EXCEPTION OF APPLICATION AND INSPECTION FEES. WHICH ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THE WAIVER