

**Historic Landmark Commission
Meeting Minutes
January 9, 2024**

Members Present

Chair Teresa Johnson
Vice-Chair Nathan Feingold
Justin Ball
Richard Hillyer
Christi Sims
Thomas Tumlinson

Staff Present

Nathan Brown, Assistant City Attorney
Christopher Looney, Planning & Development
Services Director
Katie Totman, Historic Preservation Officer
Colton Barker, Assistant Planner
Evin Wilson, Assistant Planner

Members Absent

Jillian Bliss
Susan Sonier

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Johnson called the meeting to order at 8:31 am.

2. ROLL CALL

Roll was called and a quorum was declared.

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion by Commissioner Ball, seconded by Commissioner Hillyer, to approve the regular meeting minutes of December 12, 2023. Motion carried (6-0-0).

4. CITIZENS COMMUNICATION

No one spoke.

5. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

- A) **HST23-513: Discuss and consider a Certificate of Alteration to install additional tile on the exterior of the building located at 204 W San Antonio, in the Downtown Historic District.**
Presented by Katie Totman, Historic Preservation Officer

Katie Totman presented the staff report.

Chair Johnson asked Totman what the proposed hexagonal tiles intend to cover.

Applicant, Cameron Corzine, stated that the glass on the window has concrete behind it and it will be covered to match the building façade.

Commissioner Sims and Totman discussed when the windows may have been built.

Chair Johnson asked Corzine if there are plans to place tile on all sides of the façade.

Commissioner Tumlinson said he is not a fan of the hexagonal tiles, adding that he finds it to be chaotic because colors contrast.

Chair Johnson said there have been numerous changes to this building over the years and has already been surveyed in the National Register. She expressed concern that if alterations continue, the building may not meet the historic criteria, and could become a non-contributing structure. She added that the canopy and balconette are not original to the structure.

Commissioner Ball asked if there were any further plans to alter the exterior.

Corzine said there are no plans in the works besides the proposed Certificate of Alteration.

Commissioner Sims asked for more details about the National Register.

Chair Johnson said it'll still be in the National Register district, but it will not be a contributing member to it.

Commissioner Sims said that if the goal of the Commission is to preserve the integrity of the building, then the request to add tile to the floor conflicts with historic preservation efforts.

Chair Johnson said this request will add to one of many alterations that have already been completed.

Commissioner Hillyer said he does not like the tile either, but he does not think the tile would subtract from the historical significance of the building.

Chair Johnson stated that an aesthetic preference is not part of the consideration.

Commissioner Sims said that the approval of this request could create a snowball effect, because after this meeting new alterations could be proposed to the structure.

Commissioner Ball asked Totman if the stucco is original to the façade.

Totman said she is unsure, and that the building façade may have been wood or brick.

Commissioner Ball asked if the building is architecturally compromised.

Corzine stated that the building façade was originally brick, and that he can provide pictures as proof. He added that the building was remodeled in either the 40s or 50s, which was also when awnings and windows were added.

Commissioner Sims asked Totman if the windows covering the tile were part of the original structure.

Totman said it is hard to tell with certainty because the old photos were taken from far away.

Commissioner Sims asked if the applicant was only planning on covering the black part of the glass.

Corzine said the tile will only go over the black glass.

Chair Johnson asked if there was any further discussion or a motion.

Motion by Feingold, seconded by Ball, to approve a Certificate of Alteration to install additional tile on the exterior of the building located at 204 W San Antonio, in the Downtown Historic District. Motion failed (3-3-0), with Commissioner Hillyer, Commissioner Sims, and Commissioner Tumlinson in opposition.

Commissioner Hillyer asked if the applicant could do the flat tile over the black glass instead of the hexagonal tile.

Commissioner Tumlinson objected to the request because of the hexagonal tile. He stated it is too "chaotic" and agreed with Hillyer.

Chair Johnson asked the applicant what he thought about that.

Corzine said he is open to their idea.

Commissioner Sims asked if the request for alteration can be postponed to the next meeting to get a better understanding of any other potential alterations that could be proposed.

Totman said there are no additional plans for alteration according to the applicant.

Commissioner Hillyer stated that a better rendering is needed because he finds it difficult to visualize the request.

Vice-Chair Feingold stated that the extent of the tile work needs to be explicitly stated so that the applicant cannot alter the entire façade. He added that there is too much uncertainty with what the proposal will look like on the façade.

Commissioner Sims said the Commission should not be concerned with the aesthetics of the tile and that the vote should not be dependent on the style of tile.

Commissioner Tumlinson asked Totman if the Commission has an obligation to consider the colors associated with alteration requests.

Totman explained that the code does not dictate the color of the building, but rather if the proposal is consistent with the color of the building.

Vice-Chair Feingold asked if the Commission could do a revote.

Totman asked if anyone wished to propose a motion.

Motion by Vice-Chair Feingold, seconded by Commissioner Ball, to approve a Certificate of Alteration to install additional tile on the exterior of the building located at 204 W San Antonio, in the Downtown Historic District. Motion carried (4-2-0), with Commissioner Hillyer and Commissioner Tumlinson in opposition.

6. STAFF REPORT

A) Update from staff regarding proactive efforts and violations.

Totman pitched the idea of providing updates on violations to the commission.

Commissioner Hillyer left the dais at 8:58 am.

Chair Johnson liked the idea proposed by Totman.

B) Update from the Heritage Society of New Braunfels

Commissioner Ball announced that the historic house at 242 Cowald St will be moved to the Heritage Village campus and will be restored back to its original 1853 configuration.

C) Update from the Comal County Historical Commission

Chair Johnson has no updates from the Comal County Historical Commission.

7. ITEMS FOR FEBRUARY MEETING

Totman said she is working on the new historic guidelines and wanted to provide a draft and receive feedback from both the Commission and the public.

Vice-Chair Feingold asked if there is a list of current Fachwerk buildings in town.

Totman said she will look into Vice-Chair Feingold's question and discussed potentially using a surveying app to create a digital list.

Chair Johnson asked if there were plans to do a city-wide historic survey.

Totman said she is working on getting a grant to do so.

Nathan Brown stated that the Commission should only discuss items that are on the agenda.

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chair Johnson adjourned the meeting at 9:04 am.

Lisa Johnson
Chair

2/13/24
Date