

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #:	24-438	Name:	
Type:	Recommendation	Status:	Individual Item Ready
File created:	3/21/2024	In control:	Historic Landmark Commission
On agenda:	4/9/2024	Final action:	
Title:	HLC Case HST24-112: Discuss and consider a Certificate of Alteration to replace board and batten siding on the historic structure located at 555 Hill Avenue, within the Sophienburg Hill Historic District.		
Sponsors:			
Indexes:			
Code sections:			
Attachments:	1. GIS Location Map, 2. Site Plan, 3. Site Pictures		

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

PRESENTER:

Katie Totman, HPO

SUBJECT:

HLC Case HST24-112: Discuss and consider a Certificate of Alteration to replace board and batten siding on the historic structure located at 555 Hill Avenue, within the Sophienburg Hill Historic District.

DEPARTMENT: Planning & Development Services

COUNCIL DISTRICTS IMPACTED: 5

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Code of Ordinances, Chapter 66 - Historic Preservation

Sec. 66-57. Alteration certificates for alteration or new construction affecting landmarks or historic districts.

No person shall carry out any exterior alteration, restoration, reconstruction, new construction, removal or relocation of any city designated historic landmark or on any property within a city designated historic district which may affect the appearance and cohesiveness of any historic landmark or any property within a historic district without first obtaining an alteration certification authorizing the change.

Sec. 66-58. Criteria for approval of an alteration certificate.

In considering an application for an alteration certificate, the commission shall be guided by any adopted design guidelines, and where applicable, the following from the secretary of the interior's standards for the rehabilitation of historic buildings. Any adopted design guidelines and secretary of the interior's standards shall

be made available to the property owners of historic landmarks or within historic districts.

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to adapt the property in a manner which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, object, or site and its environment.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
- (3) All buildings, structures, objects, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible.
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings, structures, objects, or sites shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building, structure, object, or site would be unimpaired.

FINDINGS:

a. The building located at 555 Hill is a one-story residential structure in the Sophienburg Hill historic district. It features two historic buildings with a newer addition connecting them in the middle.

b. **SIDING REPLACEMENT** - The applicant is requesting to replace the existing board and batten siding with Hardi board and batten siding on the historic structures to match what is currently on the new addition.

Per Criteria 2 and 6, the distinguishing original qualities of a building shall not be destroyed when possible, and the removal of historic material should be avoided when possible. Additionally, when deteriorated architectural features require replacement, the new material should reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, and other visual qualities. Replacement of existing historic/original material that is damaged beyond repair may be an acceptable treatment provided that the replacement material is compatible with the existing in dimension, material, and overall appearance. Staff made a site visit and observed a variety of batten sizes and profiles suggesting that the existing elements may not necessarily be original to the structure.

STAFF ANALYSIS:

Staff finds that the proposed siding may be an appropriate replacement in this case due to the inconsistency of the existing board and batten siding on the historic structures.

ATTACHMENTS:

1. GIS Location Map
2. Site Pictures
3. Additional Images