

Legislation Details (With Text)

File #:	21-1038	Name:	
Type:	Recommendation	Status:	Individual Item Ready
File created:	10/1/2021	In control:	Historic Landmark Commission
On agenda:	10/12/2021	Final action:	
Title:	HST21-346 Consideration of a Certificate of Alteration to remove 21 windows and to replace them with vinyl windows at 572 Magazine Ave. within the Sophienburg Hill Historic District.		
Sponsors:			
Indexes:			
Code sections:			
Attachments:	1. Location Map, 2. Application, 3. Staff Photos, 4. Submittal Documents, 5. Supplemental Documents, 6. Sec. 66-58 Criteria for Approval of Alt Cert		

Date	Ver.	Action By	Action	Result
------	------	-----------	--------	--------

PRESENTER:

Caleb Chance Gasparek
Historic Preservation Officer

SUBJECT:

HST21-346 Consideration of a Certificate of Alteration to remove 21 windows and to replace them with vinyl windows at 572 Magazine Ave. within the Sophienburg Hill Historic District.

DEPARTMENT: Planning & Development Services

COUNCIL DISTRICTS IMPACTED: District 6

BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Alteration to remove 21 historic age windows and to replace them with Champion ColorBond and TimberBond vinyl windows. The applicant has indicated that the material trim of the proposed windows is wood, and the proposed windows themselves are vinyl.

HISTORIC CONTEXT:

Deed research indicates was built in 1925 by Alfred Herry Sr. for Alwin Kroesche for \$5,000. Herry Sr. was a prominent builder of homes in New Braunfels in the early 20th century. In 1927 the house was sold to William Zipp Jr. and Louise nee Weyel. William and Louise lived at the property until 1956. Both were lifelong residents of Comal County, in 1927 William retired from his farm and moved to 572 Magazine where him and Louise lived until their deaths in 1955 and 1956.

ISSUE:

A Certificate of Alteration is required for any alteration to a landmarked property or a property within a local historic district.

FISCAL IMPACT:

Approval of a Certificate of Alteration waives all permit fees associated with the building permit.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that the removal of historic windows and replacement with vinyl windows fails to meet criteria 2, 5,

6, and 9 of Chapter 66-58 Criteria for approval of an alteration certificate, and that insufficient evidence has been provided warranting the replacement of the existing historic windows. In considering a Certificate of Alteration application, Chapter 66-58 states that “the commission shall be guided by any adopted design guidelines, and where applicable, the following from the secretary of the interior’s standards for the rehabilitation of historic buildings.”

2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, object, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed when possible. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.

Historic windows are often considered character defining features of historic homes. With the exception of the proposed picture windows, which are not historically found on craftsman homes, the proposed double-hung windows are compatible in design, but not in material construction.

5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, object, or site shall be kept where possible.

Character defining windows cannot be easily replaced and once gone the likelihood of them being replaced in-kind at some future point is unlikely. The National Park Service does not recommend “removing or radically changing windows which are important in defining the historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished.”

6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material shall reflect the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historical, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

The proposed double-hung windows match the design of the historic windows, but are of incompatible material construction. Vinyl is generally discouraged on historic homes. Furthermore, the National Park Service and Department of the Interior do not recommend “replacing an entire window when repair of materials and limited replacement of deteriorated or missing parts are appropriate.”

9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

Vinyl windows fail to meet the material requirement, and picture windows were not historically found on craftsman style homes.

ATTACHMENTS:

- A. Location Map
- B. Application
- C. Staff Photos
- D. Submittal Documents

E. Supplemental Documents

F. Sec. 66-58 Criteria for Approval of an Alteration Certificate